Evaluation of Classical Guidance Programs During The Covid-19 Pandemic at Junior High School: Discrepancy Model

(Evaluasi Program Bimbingan Klasikal Selama Pandemi Covid-19 di Sekolah Menengah Pertama: Model Discrepancy)

Hani Nurrofifah*, Muh. Farozin, Asfarina Mutiara
Department of Guidance and Counseling, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Colombo St., No 1, Sleman, Special Region of Yogyakarta, 55281 Indonesia
*corresponding author, e-mail: haninurrofifah.2019@student.uny.ac.id

Article received: January 2nd 2022; revised: March 7th 2022; accepted: March 10th 2022

Abstract: Guidance and counseling programs are designed to improve education. These programs continue to evolve, especially the classical guidance programs that require adaptation to the current Covid-19 pandemic education system. However, due to a lack of planning, the development and implementation of the classical guidance program in state junior high schools during the Covid-19 pandemic have not been optimal. Thus, this study identifies the performance of the classical guidance program at state junior high schools during the Covid-19 pandemic, using predetermined standards. This study used program evaluation standards and criteria from the Guidelines for Performance-Based Professional School Counselor Evaluation. The guidelines highlight that professional school counselors should carry out classical guidance services using effective learning strategies and classroom management techniques for all counselees based on their needs. These standards and criteria were then formulated into three components to determine the success of the classical guidance program, namely planning, implementing, and evaluating the classical guidance program. The analysis of the evaluation results showed that the classical guidance program during the Covid-19 had not met the standard.

Keywords: program evaluation; classical guidance; the discrepancy model


This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.
INTRODUCTION

The widespread of Covid-19 has affected the education sector in Indonesia. Since March 24th, 2020, the Minister of Education and Culture has issued Circular Letter Number 04 of 2020 concerning the Implementation of Educational Policies in the Emergency Period due to the Spread of Covid-19. Based on the circular letter, the learning process should be carried out online so that the students learn and teachers work from home, as an effort to ensure the continuity of education while preventing the transmission of Covid-19 in the education sector.

The change of the learning system from offline (face to face) to online carries numerous effects for all students (Monge, Gómez Hernández, & Jiménez Arenas, 2020). The new learning system results in limited virtual interaction between students and teachers as well as the entire learning process. Similarly, the transition process also affects the provision of guidance and counseling services in schools. During the Covid-19 pandemic, school counselors face many obstacles in providing guidance and counseling services (Putri, 2021). Consequently, those school counselors are required to make innovations in online-based guidance and counseling services (Putra & Shofaria, 2020). Also, they should be more active and have greater technological mastery, such as in technology applications and software, that can support guidance and counseling services during the Covid-19 pandemic (Firda & Atikah, 2020).

There are various types of settings in guidance and counseling services that help students during the Covid-19 pandemic, for example, classical settings. Classical guidance is one of the available alternatives that help students prevent various problems that may arise during the Covid-19 pandemic (Ariati, 2021; Listiyani, 2021; Matarif, 2020), as students need easy-to-use and easy-to-manage guidance and counseling services (Yuniarti & Asrowi, 2021). Classical guidance is a basic service implemented through classical or class activities presented systematically to all students to help self-development optimally (Yusuf & Nurihsan, 2012). Classical guidance services are proven to be effective and efficient in providing understanding and information to students (Bowers & Hatch, 2012).

The implementation of guidance and counseling services, especially classical guidance, is intercorrelated with the evaluation process. The Regulation of the Minister of Education and Culture Number 111 of 2014 concerning Guidance and Counseling in Basic Education and Secondary Education (Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia, 2014) mentions that one of the mandatory components of the guidance and counseling program is the evaluation plan. Boulmetis and Dutwin (2014) state that program evaluation is a systematic process to collect and analyze information on the program’s efficiency, effectiveness, and impacts in relation to the changes in counselee behavior. Evaluation of the guidance and counseling service program is essential to identify the program’s weaknesses for its future improvement and development. Through the evaluation, teachers attain feedback beneficial for the guidance and counseling service’s future development as part of their accountability (Badrujaman, 2011). This evaluation is also a form of an effort to improve the program’s quality (Ekasari, 2019). The primary purpose of the evaluation is to enhance the implementation of the guidance and counseling program and increase the accountability of the guidance and counseling program for teachers, principals, parents, and students (Gibson & Mitchell, 2005).

Evaluation for school counselors is mandatory (Gysbers & Henderson, 2014). Evaluation for counselors in various settings is vital for professional improvement as it collects objective performance data based on systematic and unbiased analysis (Gibson & Mitchell, 2005). In Indonesia, this evaluation is also mandated in the Decree of the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform No. 84 of 1993 Chapter II Article 3 regarding the primary duties of school counselors, namely to develop, implement, evaluate the implementation, analyze the results of the implementation, and construct follow up the guidance program for their students. Even during the Covid-19 pandemic, an evaluation of classical guidance programs in schools still needs to be carried out. Meanwhile, in the Covid-19 pandemic, interactions between students and teachers are carried out virtually. Virtual teaching is considered new in the Indonesian education system. Thus, the guidance and counseling services during the Covid-19 pandemic were not optimal because most students faced obstacles to participating in virtual learning (Rohmadi, Santosa, & Adindo, 2021).
School counselor at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District, Indonesia stated that the classical guidance program during the Covid-19 pandemic had been carried out online, but the planning, implementation, and evaluation of the program were not optimal. The program was not implemented using various strategies and media or tools, creating distance between school counselor and students. Thus, the evaluation of the classical guidance program is substantial for assessing the extent of the program implementation in achieving the predetermined goals (Azizah, Ginting, & Utami, 2017). Besides, evaluation results can be used to determine the urgency of further services provision and school counselors’ performance improvement (Hadiwinarto, Mishabuddin, & Sulian, 2018). Thus, the evaluation results can be the basis for developing online-based guidance and counseling services. However, the school counselor at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District reported that most of them have not evaluated the guidance and counseling program properly during the Covid-19 pandemic. Therefore, the monitoring of the program’s success and efficiency, especially the classical guidance program, during the Covid-19 pandemic does not run smoothly. Consequently, it has affected the follow-up program. As the school counselor do not have factual data regarding changes in student behavior, the students received non-appropriate services.

Some evaluation models consist of a collection of systematic information considered in the decision-making process, along with the obtained information (Scheerens, Glas, Thomas, & Thomas, 2003). One of the available evaluation models for the evaluation of the guidance and counseling program is the discrepancy model which developed by Malcolm Provus. This evaluation model determines the gap or discrepancy between the established standard with the actual performance of the implemented program (Fitzpatrick, 2011). Provus views this evaluation as a process of: (1) agreeing on certain standards, (2) determining the difference between performance and established standards, and (3) using the obtained non-conformities to decide whether to develop, continue, or discontinue the program (Fitzpatrick, 2011). This evaluation model is applicable for the classical guidance program as it offers simple procedures and requires relatively less time and cost than other evaluation models. Besides, this evaluation model can measure the size of the gap in each component of the classical guidance program between the expected and real results so that it can identify the weaknesses of the program during the Covid-19 pandemic and determine corrective actions for the future. Some previous studies have used the discrepancy model as an evaluation model for guidance and counseling programs (Barida, 2016; Saputra, 2015; Sugianto, 2018). Different from the discrepancy model, the goal attainment model ignores the planning and process of learning, as well as the discrepancy between the goals and the implementation (Badrujaman, 2011). In comparison, the responsive evaluation model is unable to prioritize or simplify information, while it is not possible to accommodate all points of view from various groups during the decision-making process (Badrujaman, 2011). Thus, this study used the discrepancy model as an evaluation model for the classical guidance program during the Covid-19 pandemic.

The standard for evaluation refers to standards and criteria in the Guidelines for Performance-Based Professional School Counselor Evaluation (Missouri Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, 2000). Standard 1, criterion 1, within the guidelines states that “professional school counselors carry out classical guidance services using effective learning strategies and classroom management techniques for all students based on their needs”. Later, this standard was formulated into three components that determine the success of the classical guidance program, namely planning, implementation, and evaluation. The planning component covers implementing a need assessment, developing topic materials, and preparing appropriate media or tools. The implementation component includes delivering material, using strategies, building a conducive environment, and recording events. The evaluation component includes the evaluation of the process and results of classical guidance services. This evaluation was carried out at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District, Indonesia. The evaluation results were used to formulate recommendations relevant to the sustainability of the classical guidance program in the future, especially during the Covid-19 pandemic.

Therefore, this study identifies the performance of the classical guidance program during the Covid-19 pandemic at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District, Indonesia using the predetermined standards. The results of this study were expected to be considered as evaluation materials for formulating a better classical guidance service program.
METHOD

This quasi-experimental research aimed to identify the differences before and after evaluation using the discrepancy model (Fitzpatrick, 2011). The evaluation procedure consisted of: (1) the definition stage, where we determined the standards and criteria for the classical guidance program, (2) the installation stage, where we designed the evaluation instrument as a measuring tool for the classical guidance service program, (3) the process stage, in which an assessment of the classical guidance program was carried out based on the collected data, (4) the results stage, where we determined the program achievement and follow-up, and (5) cost analysis, in which we compared the results with a similar comparable costs analysis. However, in this research, the cost analysis stage was not carried out because classical guidance services during the Covid-19 pandemic were carried out online and did not use (operational) fees.

The subjects of this research were school counselors at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District who carried out classical guidance services during the Covid-19 pandemic. We used purposive sampling to determine the sample (Sugiono, 2019), where the target schools represented each sub-district in Pesawaran District. The school counselors with a linear educational background carrying out classical guidance service during the Covid-19 pandemic were selected as research participants. This research involved eleven school counselors who met the predetermined criteria.

The data collection instrument used was a classical guidance program evaluation questionnaire adapted to existing conditions discovered through interviews and documentation during the evaluation. The questionnaire was designed based on the program evaluation standards and criteria from the Guidelines for Performance-Based Professional School Counselor Evaluation. The evaluation standard stated that “professional school counselors should carry out classical guidance services using effective learning strategies and classroom management techniques for all counselees based on their needs”. From this standard and criteria, three process were formulated to identify the success of the classical guidance program, namely planning, implementation, and evaluation of the classical guidance program. The planning component consisted of conducting a need assessment, developing topic material, and preparing appropriate media/tools, while the implementation component covered delivering material, using strategies, building a conducive environment, and recording events in the implementation of classical guidance services. Lastly, the evaluation included the evaluation of the process and the results of classical guidance services. The researcher attained permission to collect data at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District. The obtained data were analyzed using descriptive statistic analysis.

RESULTS

Initial data collection was conducted in September 2021 through interviews with school counselors to identify the existing problems and determine research subjects. The initial data collection process revealed that the planning, implementation, and evaluation of classical guidance programs during the Covid-19 pandemic had not been carried out optimally. Aside from the interview, the data have also collected from the instrument. The main instrument used in this study was questionnaires for the evaluation of the classical guidance program. The questionnaire was distributed to research subjects during the interviews and documentation process carried out in October 2021. The documentation was used to collect supporting data covering the implementation plan, materials, and evaluation of classical guidance and counseling services. The results of data collection from the questionnaire are presented in table 1.

From the data collected through questionnaires, we determined whether the classical guidance program was following the standard, close to the standard, or far from the standard, using the categorization proposed by Azwar (2017). The results of the categorization are presented in Table 2. Based on the results of data analysis, the evaluation of the classical guidance program at state Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District was categorized far from standard. There were only 27% of the classical guidance program activities carried out according to standards. Besides, there were 73% of aspects of classical guidance program activities partially implemented or close to the standard. Then, the guidance program that is not implemented was 0% or none. The data is illustrated in Figure 1.
Table 1. Results of The Classical Guidance Program Evaluation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Total Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Results of Categorization

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Following standard</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close to standard</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Far from standard</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the results of data analysis, the objectives of the classical guidance service program during the Covid-19 pandemic at Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District were not achieved because the implementation and evaluation components were not carried out according to standards or only close to the standards.

DISCUSSION

The results of the evaluation using the discrepancy model provide an overview of the gap between the performance of the classical guidance program during the Covid-19 pandemic and the predetermined standards. Meanwhile, the results of questionnaire data analysis showed that the classical guidance program during the Covid-19 pandemic at State junior High Schools in Pesawaran District is still far from standard. Similar results were also suggested by data obtained through the interview guide and documentation.
The results of a comprehensive examination of the questionnaire, the interview, and the documentation results indicated that some activities carried out by the school counselors have not met the standard or are still in the close to standard category.

**Strategies of Classical Guidance Services**

School counselors at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District have carried out online classical guidance services during the Covid-19 pandemic. However, they did not have an effective strategy and tended to use monotonous strategies because they were still adapting to the new conditions of online classical guidance services. Besides, they also did not have the skills to develop various online learning strategies. Consequently, the students did not enjoy the classical guidance services since they easily got bored. Therefore, it is vital to encourage the school counselors in this district to provide an effective strategy for classical guidance services during the Covid-19 pandemic.

Theory suggests that during the Covid-19 pandemic, classical guidance services should adopt innovative and effective service strategies since these services are one of the methods that support students’ potential and can reach all students (Lopez & Mason, 2017; Yusuf & Nurhisan, 2012). Additionally, the classical guidance services provide essential information for students in fulfilling their developmental tasks and achieving their goals (personal, social, learning, and career) (Mulawarman, Susilawati, Syifa, & Rifani, 2020). During the Covid-19 pandemic, besides developing professional competence and paying attention to the mental health of students, school counselors should also communicate with families of students with no adequate facilities to participate in online learning (Mielgo-Conde, Seijas-Santos, & Grande-de-Prado, 2021). Studies have confirmed the efficiency of classical guidance services in increasing the learning motivation of students who experience difficulties in understanding the material and laziness due to boredom with online learning (Susanto, Purwanti, & Suroto, 2021).

Effective and diverse strategies and methods are needed to support the implementation of classical guidance services during the Covid-19 pandemic in order to achieve the objectives and have a positive influence on all students. Therefore, school counselors should be innovative in implementing their services during the Covid-19 pandemic. As discovered in the previous study, for the effective guidance and counseling services implementation, school counselors need to be introduced to some strategies, methods, and online learning applications, as well as be required to have innovative online-based services, optimize services, and improve peer roles in guidance and counseling services during the Covid-19 pandemic (Putra & Shofaria, 2020).

**Utilization of Media/Tools**

During the Covid-19 pandemic, school counselors at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District have used media/tools to carry out the classical online guidance services. However, the use of media is less optimal as they tend to use the same media/tools in each session. Even some of the teachers admitted that they did not have any ideas of the media or tools that can be used for online classical guidance services as they had not received the training on online media or tools that can be used during the pandemic. This result is linear with the result of a previous study highlighting many counselors’ confusion in running an online guidance program as there is no digital training provided prior to these unexpected situations (Mielgo-Conde et al., 2021). According to ASCA, school counselors are part of a digital society that also needs to use technology and software applications to improve their academic services, careers, and the socio-emotional development of students (American School Counselor Association, 2016).

Various types of media or tools are available for guidance and counseling services, especially for classical online guidance, such as social media (WhatsApp, Instagram, Facebook, Twitter, MySpace), Sparkol Videoscribe, Sway, Quipper, Edmodo, Webex, Zoom, Google Classroom, Google Meet and others (Sholihah & Handayani, 2020). However, most school counselors at State Junior High Schools in the Pesawaran District commonly only used WhatsApp, Telegram, Google Classroom, and Google
Forms. A previous study has placed Google Classroom and Google Form as the most frequently used media or tools for classical guidance services during the Covid-19 pandemic since the school counselors tend to be more asynchronous than synchronous (Hastuti & Tyas, 2021). However, Google Classroom is less effective for online classical guidance services due to its various limitations, such as limited communication and interaction between school counselors and students and students’ decreased motivation and enthusiasm for learning (Kamalia, Suyati, & Maulia, 2020).

Therefore, school counselors are required to use proper media or tools and innovate the services to address the problems faced by students during the Covid-19 pandemic. If the school counselors can utilize various media, tools, or applications, they will better implement classical guidance services during the Covid-19 pandemic. The use of technology-based media or tools offers multiple advantages in terms of interaction, access to information, flexibility in problem orientation, optimization of guidance service, and autonomy gained, as well as participants’ personal and professional development (Missouri Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, 2000). However, in implementing technology-based guidance and counseling services using these applications, the school counselors need to consider the possible obstacles or challenges, strengths, weaknesses, and codes of ethics (Gozali, 2020). Although classical guidance services at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District can be carried out online during the pandemic, the school counselors are expected to improve their ability to utilize various media, tools or applications to provide effective services for all students.

Evaluation of Classical Guidance Services

School counselors at State Junior High Schools in Pesawaran District have not evaluated the classical guidance program optimally during the pandemic. The evaluation should cover both the process and results of the program, however the research participants only evaluated the process of the program, not the results. Meanwhile, the evaluation must be carried out on the program’s relevant and influential elements to attain feedback from the evaluation (Hidayat, 2020). The evaluation of the process and results should be carried out to examine the program’s effectiveness and find possible program improvements. If the results of classical guidance services are not evaluated, the school counselors do not have empirical or factual data describing changes in student behavior after classical guidance services. Thus, it results in bias or subjective follow-up for the program.

For school counselors, evaluation is a mandatory duty (Gysbers & Henderson, 2014). It is an attempt to obtain various information on a regular, continuous, and comprehensive basis about the process and results of the students’ attitudes and behavior or developmental tasks progress throughout the service programs. According to Boulmetis and Dutwin (2014), program evaluation is a systematic process to collect and analyze information on the efficiency, effectiveness, and influence of the program in transforming students’ behavior. The evaluation results of the classical guidance program can be used as the primary consideration for school counselors in determining the urgency of further services and improvement of their performance.

Therefore, the implementation and evaluation components have a close to standard category. It is expected that the classical guidance program can be improved through a better planning process with innovative and more diverse adoption of strategies and media or tools in the implementation of online classical guidance services. Also, school counselors are expected to have a deeper understanding of the evaluation process of guidance and counseling programs to improve their performance and ensure that students attain the program benefits. Besides, one of the efforts to improve the implementation and evaluation of the guidance and counseling service program during the Covid-19 pandemic is attending training on strategies, media, or tool innovation and evaluations for guidance and counseling services.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the analysis of the questionnaire data, as well as the interview and documentation results, the classical counseling service during the Covid-19 pandemic at State Junior High Schools in the Pesawaran district is still far from standard. There were only 27% of the aspects of
service activities that had been carried out according to standards. Then, 73% of the aspect of the service activities were partially implemented or close to the standard. Meanwhile, there were no unimplemented aspects of service activities. Consequently, these findings should be concerning for the schools and school counselors as the program practitioners. To improve the program’s implementation, the school counselors should follow the predetermined standards to achieve the program’s goals and provide a positive influence on students or counselees. In addition, the findings of this study can be an input to improve the evaluation system for the counseling program, especially the classical counseling service.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

We address our sincere gratitude to all parties involved in the research, particularly the school counselors of the State Junior High School Pesawaran District, who has participated in this research. We also thank the Graduate Program of Guidance and Counseling program of Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta. Hopefully, this research can be useful for the development of educational science, especially the evaluation of guidance and counseling programs.

**REFERENCES**


